



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 54

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Third Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Wednesday, November 24, 1999

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

The Speaker made a statement in recognition of the anniversary of Hon. Mrs. McClellan's election in a by-election in the constituency of Drumheller-Chinook. Recognition was also given to the birthdays being celebrated today by: Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora; Mr. Jacques, Hon. Member for Grande Prairie-Wapiti; and Ms Kryczka, Hon. Member for Calgary-West.

Presenting Petitions

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 150 Albertans requesting the freezing of tuition and institutional fees and an increase in post-secondary education support.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 57 Edmonton residents requesting increased funding for speech language pathology and occupational therapies based on children's needs.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, presented a petition from 116 Albertans requesting increased support for public and separate schools to levels which will cover increased costs.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 105 Albertans requesting increased support for public and separate schools to levels which will cover increased costs.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 455 Edmonton and area residents requesting an independent public inquiry of the Workers' Compensation Act including an examination of the operations of the WCB (Workers' Compensation Board), the Appeals Commission, and the criteria for appointments to the Board.

Ms Barrett, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands, presented a petition from 110 Albertans requesting the introduction of legislation banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 120 Albertans requesting an independent public inquiry into the complete operations of the Workers' Compensation Board of Alberta.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 107 Albertans requesting increased funding for public and separate schools to levels which will cover increased costs.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned, urge the Legislative Assembly to freeze tuition and institutional fees and increase support in the foundation of post-secondary education.

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to conduct an independent public inquiry of the Workers' Compensation Act, including an examination of the operations of the WCB, the Appeals Commission, and the criteria for appointments to the Board.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to introduce a Bill banning the establishment of private, for-profit hospitals to ensure that the integrity of public, universal health care may be maintained.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Dr. Taylor, Minister of Innovation and Science, pursuant to the Alberta Agricultural Research Institute Act, cA-13.7, s16(2):

Alberta Agricultural Research Institute, Annual Report 1998-99
Sessional Paper 1087/99

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, pursuant to the Nursing Profession Act, cN-14.5, s11(2):

Alberta Association of Registered Nurses (AARN), Annual Report 1997-98
Sessional Paper 1088/99

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, pursuant to the Optometry Profession Act, cO-10, s6(4):

Alberta College of Optometrists, Annual Report 1998
Sessional Paper 1089/99

Ms Barrett, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Highlands:

Universal Health Care book chapter entitled "How Canadians Got Universal Coverage," produced by Armstrong and Fegan, The New Press, 1998
Sessional Paper 1090/99

Excerpt quote on page 235 from "Tommy Douglas," by Doris Shackleton, published by McClelland and Stewart, 1975
Sessional Paper 1091/99

14 postcards entitled "Be Like Mike" addressed to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, produced by Equal=Alberta in support for equal treatment for all Albertans regardless of sexual orientation
Sessional Paper 1092/99

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated November 17, 1999, from Dr. Alice Khin, Burma Watch International Director, to Members of the Legislative Assembly, regarding a message from Nobel Peace Prize winner Aung San Suu Kyi thanking Canadians for their support in the struggle for democracy in Burma
Sessional Paper 1093/99

14 postcards entitled "Be Like Mike" addressed to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, produced by Equal=Alberta in support for equal treatment for all Albertans regardless of sexual orientation
Sessional Paper 1094/99

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Letter dated November 9, 1999, from Mrs. Tarchuk, Hon. Member for Banff-Cochrane, to Dr. Patricia Bayne, Coordinator of Women's Program and Menopause Clinic, Grey Nuns Hospital, Edmonton, expressing support for information presented to the Standing Policy Committee on Health and Safe Communities, with attached fact sheet entitled "Health of Women: Projects Supported by Alberta Health and Wellness"

Sessional Paper 1095/99

Bibliography detailing materials related to osteoporosis entitled "References"

Sessional Paper 1096/99

Postcards entitled "Be Like Mike" addressed to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, produced by Equal=Alberta in support for equal treatment for all Albertans regardless of sexual orientation

Sessional Paper 1097/99

9 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Albertans to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1098/99

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

Letter dated September 28, 1999, from Raymond Carifelle to Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations, with attached petition signed by members of the Peavine Metis Settlement regarding the voluntary registration as Status Indians after November 1, 1990 to continue to remain listed on the Settlement Members List

Sessional Paper 1099/99

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Letter dated November 5, 1999, from Allan P. Jobson to Hon. Mr. Dunford, Minister of Human Resources and Employment, with attached documentation (evidence package 6) regarding a WCB (Workers' Compensation Board) claim

Sessional Paper 1100/99

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Jacquie Eales to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1101/99

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Paul Miranda to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1102/99

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Regina Olvera to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1103/99

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

4 letters dated April 30, 1999, from Shauna McLean, Sandi Olsen, Jody Francis, and Maureen Fischer to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1104/99

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Correspondence Relating to a 1998 Complaint to the Facilities Review Committee by the Member for Edmonton-Riverview and the Subsequent Investigation by the Provincial Ombudsman, 1998-99, submitted by Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, dated November 24, 1999

Sessional Paper 1105/99

Campaign 2000: Report Card on Child Poverty in Canada 1989 - 1999, produced by the Family Service Association of Toronto

Sessional Paper 1106/99

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Letter dated November 24, 1999, from Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, to Robert C. Clark, Information and Privacy Commissioner, an analysis of the Commissioner's response to Bill 40, Health Information Act, dated November 22, 1999

Sessional Paper 1107/99

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Cherilun Michaels to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1108/99

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Amanda Woodward to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1109/99

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Danielle Monroe to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1110/99

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Deanna Geggero to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1111/99

Letter dated April 30, 1999, from Laeonie Ferguson to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing support for funding of midwifery in Alberta

Sessional Paper 1112/99

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter dated November 16, 1999, from Caroline Inglis to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the Premier's newscast of November 16, 1999, and expressing opposition to health care privatization initiatives

Sessional Paper 1113/99

Letter dated November 9, 1999, from Bill Holmes to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the Canada Health Plan as introduced by Monique Bégin and passed by the Federal Government in 1984

Sessional Paper 1114/99

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Article dated August 5, 1999, entitled "The Association between For-profit Hospital Ownership and Increased Medicare Spending," written by Elaine M. Silverman, Jonathan S. Skinner, and Elliott S. Fischer, published in the New England Journal of Medicine

Sessional Paper 1115/99

Petition signed by 4 Edmonton residents requesting the reinstatement of the boundaries for the constituency offices as they were prior to February 11, 1997, or to increase to two the number of MLAs (Members of the Legislative Assembly) in each existing constituency

Sessional Paper 1116/99

Letter dated November 12, 1999, from Jim and Rose Hugo to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the plight of the grain producer in Western Canada

Sessional Paper 1117/99

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. Gordon, Hon. Member for Lacombe-Stettler, tabled the following:

Kingston Whig-Standard newspaper article entitled "Hospital association sees future in business partnerships," written by Sarah Lambert, with attached Globe and Mail newspaper article entitled "Why we need a dose of private medicine: Alberta's small step a giant leap for Canada, says former head of OMA (Ontario Medical Association)," written by William Orovan

Sessional Paper 1118/99

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, tabled the following:

Letter dated November 23, 1999, from Michael O'Connor, President, Alberta Chamber of Commerce, expressing support for the Alberta Government's leadership in the area of health care reform with the release of the Health Policy Statement which outlines the principles governing private sector involvement within the publicly funded health care system

Sessional Paper 1119/99

Recognitions

Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie: Museum of the Regiments located in Calgary-Currie for efforts to honour our war dead during a Remembrance Day celebration.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre: Mature Women's Program at the Grey Nuns Hospital in Edmonton, Women's Wellness Action Committee, and the Edmonton Osteoporosis Support Group.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona: Ms Aung San Suu Kyi, 1991 Nobel Peace Prize recipient, for efforts to promote democracy in Burma.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry: Sports Central's distribution of sports equipment free of charge to under-privileged children.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Written Questions

The following Written Questions were accepted as amended:

WQ218. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

What is the breakdown of the economic impact of the \$600 million provincial income tax cut under the 11% single rate proposal for Years 1 through 5 inclusive, as cited on page 162 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, attributed to the components of: the elimination of the 8% surtax, the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions in the 1999 federal budget, and the introduction of the 11% single rate tax by the following: real GDP, employment, labour force, unemployment rate, net in-migration, personal disposable income, real consumer spending, corporate profits, and real business investment?

Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, on behalf of Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, moved the motion be amended to read:

What information has been prepared by or for Alberta Treasury on the breakdown of the economic impact of the \$600 million provincial income tax cut under the 11% single rate proposal for Years 1 through 5 inclusive, as cited on page 162 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, attributed to the components of: the elimination of the 8% surtax, the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions in the 1999 federal budget, and the introduction of the 11% single rate tax by the following: real GDP, employment, labour force, unemployment rate, net in-migration, personal disposable income, real consumer spending, corporate profits, and real business investment?

WQ219. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

How much of the \$35 million economic offset or revenue recovery projected in 2001-02, as cited on page 17 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, results from the reduction of the 8% surtax, from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions contained in the 1999 federal budget, from the reduction of the 0.5% flat tax, from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, and from the introduction of the 11% single rate?

Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, on behalf of Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, moved the motion be amended to read:

What information has been prepared by or for Alberta Treasury on how much of the \$35 million economic offset or revenue recovery projected in 2001-02, as cited on page 17 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, results from the reduction of the 8% surtax, from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions contained in the 1999 federal budget, from the reduction of the 0.5% flat tax, from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, and from the introduction of the 11% single rate tax?

WQ220. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

How much of the \$20 million economic offset or revenue recovery projected in 2000-01, as cited on page 17 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, results from the reduction of the 8% surtax and how much is from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions contained in the 1999 federal budget?

Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Deputy Government House Leader, on behalf of Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, moved the motion be amended to read:

What information has been prepared by or for Alberta Treasury on how much of the \$20 million economic offset or revenue recovery projected in 2000-01, as cited on page 17 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, results from the reduction of the 8% surtax and how much is from the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions contained in the 1999 federal budget?

WQ226. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

What is the breakdown of the fiscal impact of the \$600 million provincial income tax cut under the 11% single rate proposal for Years 1 through 5 inclusive, as cited on page 163 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, attributed to the components of the elimination of the 8% surtax, the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions in the 1999 federal budget, and the introduction of the 11% single rate tax by the following: personal income tax, corporate income tax, other direct taxes, fuel and indirect taxes, federal transfers, other transfers, direct fiscal impact and revenue recovery?

Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of International and Intergovernmental Relations, on behalf of Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, moved the motion be amended to read:

What information has been prepared by or for Alberta Treasury on the breakdown of the fiscal impact of the \$600 million provincial income tax cut under the 11% single rate proposal for Years 1 through 5 inclusive, as cited on page 163 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, attributed to the components of the elimination of the 8% surtax, the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions in the 1999 federal budget, and the introduction of the 11% single rate tax by the following: personal income tax, corporate income tax, other direct taxes, fuel and indirect taxes, federal transfers, other transfers, direct fiscal impact and revenue recovery?

WQ227. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

How much of the revenue recovery or economic offset projected in Year 5, as cited on page 163 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, is accounted for by the elimination of the 8% surtax, the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions in the 1999 federal budget, and the introduction of the 11% single rate?

Hon. Mr. Havelock, Minister of Economic Development, on behalf of Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, moved the motion be amended to read:

What information has been prepared by or for Alberta Treasury on how much of the revenue recovery or economic offset projected in Year 5, as cited on page 163 of Budget 1999: Government of Alberta Fiscal Plan, is accounted for by the elimination of the 8% surtax, the elimination of the 0.5% flat tax, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions to \$11,620, the increase in the personal and spousal exemptions in the 1999 federal budget, and the introduction of the 11% single rate?

The following Written Questions were ordered to stand:

WQ231, WQ232, WQ237, WQ242, WQ243, WQ244, WQ245, WQ246, WQ247, WQ252, WQ254, WQ255.

Motions for Returns

The following Motions for Returns were rejected:

MR221. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the February 10, 1994 letter from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR222. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the January 18, 1994 letter from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR223. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the January 11, 1994 letter from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR224. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the January 31, 1994 letter from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR225. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the January 17, 1994 letter from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR228. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the March 2, 1994 letters from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR229. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the January 28, 1994 letter from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR230. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the minutes and agenda from the June 27, 1995 meeting of the Provincial Cabinet, in the possession of the Executive Council/Office of the Premier, relating to the discussion on the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR235. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the agenda and minutes from the March 21, 1994, meeting of the Agenda and Priorities Committee, in the possession of the Executive Council/Office of the Premier, relating to the discussion on the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

MR236. Moved by Mr. Sapers:

A copy of the February 9, 1993, letter from a third party to the Executive Council/Office of the Premier relating to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall.

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

MR233, MR234, MR238, MR239, MR240, MR241, MR248, MR249, MR250, MR251, MR253.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, that it be called 5:30 p.m., it was agreed at 5:23 p.m. that when the Assembly reconvened at 8:00 p.m. it would be in Committee of the Whole, and the Acting Speaker left the Chair.

WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 24, 1999 — 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair.

The following Bill was reported:

Bill 41 Regulated Accounting Profession Act — Mr. Melchin

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 40 Health Information Act — Ms Graham

A debate followed.

Mr. Gibbons moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:01 p.m. until Thursday, November 25, 1999, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Wednesday, November 24, 1999